**ORIGINAL** 

#### In the Matter Of:

LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEAL

#### **HEARING**

*September 20, 2017* 



800.211.DEPO (3376) EsquireSolutions.com

| 1  | x  |
|----|--|
| 2  | LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEAL                |
| 3  | ARMAND GUSTAVE, LLC & JAMES EAGAN                                |
| 4  |  |
| 5  | 116 Hampton Road, Southampton, New York 11968                    |
| 6  | x  |
| 7  | September 20, 2017<br>3:40 p.m.                                  |
| 8  | 0.10 F.m.  |
| 9  | PRESENT:   |
| 10 | CARRIE MEEK GALLAGHER, Chairwoman<br>JAY SCHNEIDERMAN, Member    |
| 11 | SEAN WALTER, Member  JOHN PAVACIC, Executive Director            |
| 12 | DON McCORMICK, Representative BRENDA PRUSINOWSKI, Representative |
| 13 | JOHN MILAZZO, Special Counsel CAROL SHOLL, Commission Staff      |
| 14 | JANET LONGO, Member DORIAN DALE, Member                          |
| 15 | EMILY KLINE, Member  |
| 16 |  |
| 17 |  |
| 18 |  |
| 19 |  |
| 20 |  |
| 21 |  |
| 22 |  |
| 23 |  |
| 24 |  |
| 25 |  |



| 1  | MS. GALLAGHER: We are about to           |
|----|--|
| 2  | start the Public Hearing on the Letter   |
| 3  | of Interpretation Credit Allocation      |
| 4  | Appeal, Armand Gustave, LLC and James    |
| 5  | Eagan. We are starting at 3:40 p.m. on   |
| 6  | September 20th in Southampton Town Hall. |
| 7  | MR. MILAZZO: Do you want to do           |
| 8  | appearances?                             |
| 9  | MS. GALLAGHER: Carrie Meek               |
| 10 | Gallagher, Chairwoman for the Pine       |
| 11 | Barrens Commission and Regional Director |
| 12 | for DEC.                                 |
| 13 | MR. WALTER: Sean Walter, Member.         |
| 14 | MS. LONGO: Janet Longo, Suffolk          |
| 15 | County.                                  |
| 16 | MR. SCHNEIDERMAN: Jay Schneiderman,      |
| 17 | Commissioner.                            |
| 18 | MS. KLINE: Emily Kline, designee         |
| 19 | for supervisor.                          |
| 20 | MR. DALE: Dorian Dale, Suffolk           |
| 21 | County.                                  |
| 22 | MR. TVERDYY: Thank you. I'm Jerry        |
| 23 | Tverdyy for the Central Pine Barrens     |
| 24 | Commission and I have just submitted     |
| 25 | Staff Exhibits A through H into the      |



- 1 hearing record. As stated in the
- 2 | hearing notice, Armand Gustave, LLC and
- 3 | James Eagan is appealing the Letter of
- 4 Interpretation of allocation for the
- 5 parcel number 900-279-4-13.1. The
- 6 | letter from the appellant is in Staff
- 7 | Exhibit A.
- 8 The parcel is located in the Town of
- 9 Southampton within the CR-200 zoning
- 10 | southwest of Exit 63 on Sunrise Highway.
- 11 The property map showing the parcel would
- 12 be Exhibit B and the aerial is Exhibit C.
- 13 The parcel was created in 2017 by
- 14 | combining ten separate parcels and
- abandonment of the paper street roads.
- 16 You can see the Certificate of Abandonment
- 17 | in Exhibit D and updated tax sheet, which
- 18 | indicates the parcel size of 20.88 acres
- 19 in Exhibit E.
- 20 As per chapter 6 of the plan, Section
- 21 | 6.3, which is Exhibit F, the Clearinghouse
- 22 | allocates credits to parcels existing as
- 23 of June 28, 1995. Based on the
- 24 | information we have, the parcel didn't
- 25 | exist in 1995, therefore, the



#### HEARING Septer LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEAL

- 1 | Clearinghouse was unable to allocate Pine
- 2 | Barrens Credits to the parcel as stated
- 3 | in the Letter of Interpretation dated
- 4 August 15, 2017 and it is Exhibit G.
- 5 | That's all I have for now and the
- 6 appellant is here, Mr. Armand.
- 7 MS. PRUSINOWSKI: May I ask a
- 8 question, please?
- 9 MS. GALLAGHER: Yes.
- 10 MS. PRUSINOWSKI: Jerry, can you
- 11 | give us an idea where in Westhampton
- 12 | this is?
- 13 MR. TVERDYY: Yeah. It's just
- 14 | southwest off Exit 63 on Sunrise in the
- 15 | middle of grids.
- MS. PRUSINOWSKI: So this is --
- 17 okay.
- 18 MR. BARON: Good afternoon. For the
- 19 appellants, Peter Baron, 532 Broad
- 20 | Hollow Road, Melville, New York. I
- 21 | thought we would add a new face to the
- 22 | Eagan people to try to explain the
- 23 | situation and see if we can reach an
- 24 | accord.

25

We would like to place exhibits in the



record as well. So with the help of 1 2 Mr. Armand Eagan, we are going to identify 3 them and place them in the record. The first is Exhibit A. This is actually a 4 5 duplicate of -- this is the denial letter 6 from the --7 MS. GALLAGHER: We have that. MR. BARON: You have that from the 8 9 Clearinghouse. We will move onto 10 Exhibit B in our packet. It's G in the 11 Commission's packet. Then we also have Exhibit B, which is the deed for the 12 13 prior owner. 14 MR. MILAZZO: For clarity of the 15 record, can we make yours number? 16 MR. BARON: Sure. That will be a 17 good idea. 18 MR. MILAZZO: So A will be 1 --19 MR. BARON: Will be 1. 20 MR. MILAZZO: -- and B will be 2. 21 It will make it easier for everybody 22 later on. MR. BARON: We will have them deemed 23 marked as 2. 24



25

MR. MILAZZO: That's fine.

|    | LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEAL |
|----|---|
| 1  | Armand, if you can do me a favor, the             |
| 2  | ones that we are going to attach to the           |
| 3  | record, just put them in a pile on the            |
| 4  | table and we will make sure that will be          |
| 5  | included in the transcript, and that way          |
| 6  | the transcript is complete and then all of        |
| 7  | your exhibits are in there as well.               |
| 8  | B will be 2. So B is a deed from                  |
| 9  | dated June 14, 1973, between Joe Gazza and        |
| 10 | Peter Filingeri and others. That's going          |

MR. BARON: Right.

to be Exhibit 2.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

MR. MILAZZO: Thank you.

MR. BARON: Armand, if you could, on the official copy for the record, why don't you take a pen and change that from A to 1 and B to 2 and so on.

Then Exhibit 3 now is going to be the letter from Legislator Romaine back in 2007.

MR. MILAZZO: Thank you.

MR. BARON: D also contains the deed, the aerial photograph and the record created in connection with Gazza.

MR. MILAZZO: So Exhibit 4?



| 1  | MR. BARON: 4. I'm sorry. Exhibit         |
|----|--|
| 2  | 4, which was previously D, is the Garzle |
| 3  | parcel Gazza, I should say, as well      |
| 4  | as an aerial map followed by the record. |
| 5  | MR. MILAZZO: So Exhibit 4 is a           |
| 6  | deed, first page of the Conservation     |
| 7  | Easement from Joe Gazza to the           |
| 8  | Commission, an aerial photo of           |
| 9  | presumably the ground parcels and a      |
| 10 | transcript of the hearing. Am I right?   |
| 11 | MR. BARON: That is correct.              |
| 12 | Exhibit 5 makes reference to an aerial   |
| 13 | of the Alberto Sipala matter. It also    |
| 14 | contains a decision with the Commission, |
| 15 | as well as the transcripts prior to that |
| 16 | when the arguments were made.            |
| 17 | I think we are up to 6 now; is that      |
| 18 | correct? 6 is going to be the sanitary   |
| 19 | code, Suffolk County. The next is 7.     |
| 20 | Correct, Armand?                         |
| 21 | MR. ARMAND EAGAN: Yeah.                  |
| 22 | MR. MILAZZO: It would have been G.       |
| 23 | MR. BARON: Right. Exhibit G is           |
| 24 | going to be the AVR Rose-Breslin         |
| 25 | project. It includes a determination or  |



1 a thought process as well as 2 photographs. 3 MR. DALE: Just a quick 4 interjection. In looking at 6, the 5 sanitary code, did you want to limit it 6 to just a portion of the realty 7 subdivision? Because it would appear 8 you are missing page 5, which would lead 9 into page 6 hearing. So it's a partial? 10 MR. BARON: 766 605 B-2. MR. DALE: B-2. So that's all you 11 12 are looking at? 13 THE WITNESS: Right. Now we are up 14 to 8 --15 MR. MILAZZO: Η. 16 MR. BARON: There's 8 and 9. Т 17 believe. Waltel is --18 MS. GALLAGHER: Gazza. 19 MR. MILAZZO: I have Gazza. MR. BARON: 9 is the Waltel. 20 21 MR. MILAZZO: What's 8? Is it 22 Gazza? 23 MR. BARON: 8 is Gazza. MR. MILAZZO: So it's a resolution 24



dated March 17, 2004.

| 1  | MR. BARON: Yes. Sorry about all          |
|----|--|
| 2  | the confusion.                           |
| 3  | MR. MILAZZO: That's okay.                |
| 4  | MR. BARON: And then the last one,        |
| 5  | if we can agree on is that's 9. 9 is     |
| 6  | Waltel. J, which is now going to be 10,  |
| 7  | the last exhibit, that's two letters,    |
| 8  | one from Ms. Plunkett and one from       |
| 9  | Mr. Milazzo.                             |
| 10 | MR. MILAZZO: '95 letter and a '99        |
| 11 | letter.                                  |
| 12 | MR. BARON: Correct.                      |
| 13 | MR. WALTER: Can I just ask you a         |
| 14 | question? It says it's a Conservation    |
| 15 | Easement. Are you aware in that exhibit  |
| 16 | there's meeting minutes?                 |
| 17 | MR. BARON: Yes.                          |
| 18 | MR. WALTER: That's what you want?        |
| 19 | MR. BARON: Yes. I'm sorry, yes,          |
| 20 | the minutes as well.                     |
| 21 | MR. MILAZZO: Just going on, I just       |
| 22 | want to remark, Mr. Eagan and his        |
| 23 | counsel provided ten exhibits. We have   |
| 24 | not had a chance to review any of these, |
| 25 | we haven't had a chance to hear oral     |



| 1  | arguments that are being made today. So  |
|----|--|
| 2  | just as a threshold, we are probably     |
| 3  | going to need a little more time to      |
| 4  | consider the significant amount of       |
| 5  | materials that you have provided.        |
| 6  | MR. BARON: Well, can we make our         |
| 7  | arguments now and then reserve decision? |
| 8  | MR. MILAZZO: Of course. I just           |
| 9  | want to make sure at the beginning       |
| 10 | it's not at the end of hearing it's not  |
| 11 | a rush to have a decision made           |
| 12 | MR. ARMAND EAGAN: More time, no,         |
| 13 | absolutely not                           |
| 14 | MR. MILAZZO: because the                 |
| 15 | Commission is not necessarily going to   |
| 16 | be able to do that.                      |
| 17 | MR. McCORMICK: Actually, John, as a      |
| 18 | matter of point, you're accepting the    |
| 19 | exhibits on the question of              |
| 20 | admissibility, but not on the weight of  |
| 21 | these documents                          |
| 22 | MR. MILAZZO: And also that we            |
| 23 | probably are not going to be able to     |
| 24 | render a decision today given the        |



documents --

|    | LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEAL |
|----|---|
| 1  | MR. BARON: So wait                                |
| 2  | MR. MILAZZO: So let's                             |
| 3  | MR. BARON: Are you looking for an                 |
| 4  | extension of time or are you just                 |
| 5  | looking to read the exhibits?                     |
| 6  | MR. MILAZZO: So we can off the                    |
| 7  | record because it's                               |
| 8  | MR. ARMAND EAGAN: No, don't go off                |
| 9  | the record. Don't go off the record.              |
| 10 | MR. MILAZZO: No. We are going to                  |
| 11 | go back on the record. What we have is            |
| 12 | ten items. You are going to make an               |
| 13 | argument, which the Commission will have          |
| 14 | to consider. The provision in the plan            |
| 15 | says it gives 30 days to appeal.                  |
| 16 | There's no deadline for the Commission            |
| 17 | to decide and appeal, so we will reserve          |
| 18 | decision. We will probably need an                |
| 19 | extension even though there's no                  |
| 20 | deadline, as a matter of courtesy, so             |

that we are all on the same timeline

with respect to making this decision.

ability to consider your argument

Otherwise, the Commission would have no



enlight of testimony.

21

22

23

24

2.0

So I just wanted to say that at the beginning so that at the end you are not saying, Okay, I'm ready for my approval or my denial or my number of credits. Just so there's no confusion because -- and I think as a process matter the Commission can't decide.

MR. BARON: I understand you are receiving voluminous documents and these documents clearly, clearly support -- and they were tailored and identified because they clearly support our position that we are entitled to one credit per acre or nondevelopment, and I would ask that you do it and I would ask that you do it as reasonably as quickly as you can without delaying a decision on this.

MR. MILAZZO: Of course. The

Commission turns over decisions as fast
as we can, but I just did not want to
have the argument at the end of this
hearing that we are ready for our
decision and if we don't have it, there
will be some consequence. With that



| understanding in place, I appreciate the |
|--|
| courtesy. We should listen to your       |
| arguments and tell us about these ten    |
| supporting arguments you are going to    |
| make.                                    |

MR. BARON: As the Commission is well aware, as Counsel, my clients have 20.88 acres in Southampton. It fronts Warren Street, 500 feet east of Summit Boulevard, 1,200 feet south of Sunrise Highway. It's a dirt roadway; it's public; it's passable; it's drivable; you can drive on it; you can turn around on it. There's utilities there.

As per the Pine Barrens Commission in prior rulings, it's a road. It fits into zoning of CR-200. It's a hydrological zone 3 and it's owned for 5 acres or 200,000 square feet. With all due respect, it's our position that the applicant's application before the Clearinghouse should have ended in a different result.

I think the main argument being made here by the Commission is that somehow the



| deed is different for the Eagans and       |
|--|
| Armand Gustave then it was with the prior  |
| owner, which predates the Commission in    |
| 1995, and it's simply not true. The        |
| parcel and that's why we gave you the      |
| deeds is exactly the same. Exactly the     |
| same in 2017, as it was in 1978, as it was |
| in 1995 when the Commission was created.   |

The abandonment of a road respectfully does not change the map designation. It simply means that the owner of either side now owns the property to the middle of what was the former road and this should arguably have no effect on the Pine Barrens Clearinghouse in awarding credits.

The property is in the core, the lot contains 10 parcels of land, which were made up originally of smaller parcels and each of these 10 parcels have a designation of one and a half acres.

We are providing a letter as one of the exhibits from Mr. Ed Romaine who was a legislature at the time in connection with the Ringhoff matter, which was also A-5 zoning, same as this property, and



| 1  | Mr. Romaine clearly stated and presented  |
|----|---|
| 2  | it to the Commission, the Ringhoff's      |
| 3  | should be granted the same one credit per |
| 4  | acre allowable as other properties in the |
| 5  | vicinity that were five-acre zoned at the |
| 6  | time of the passage of the Pine Barrens   |
| 7  | Act. And I submit to you with the same    |
| 8  | that you applied to Ringhoff to us for    |
| 9  | this property, they are entitled to one   |
| 10 | acre one Pine Barrens Credit per acre.    |
| 11 | MR. WALTER: Can I ask you a               |
| 12 | question?                                 |
| 13 | MR. BARON: Sure.                          |
| 14 | MR. WALTER: Assume Ed Romaine's           |
| 15 | letter doesn't carry weight as a county   |
| 16 | legislature, but did the Pine Barrens     |
| 17 | Commission issue one credit per acre in   |
| 18 | the Ringhoff case?                        |
| 19 | MR. BARON: Being told in the              |
| 20 | Ringhoff matter they had beneficial use   |
| 21 | of the land which is different than       |
| 22 | what's being it was farmland. It          |
| 23 | wasn't property to be vacant, but what's  |
| 24 | important in connection with what Mr      |



MR. MILAZZO:

I'm sorry to

interrupt. You know what? The question
wasn't answered. So the question was
did the Commission --

MR. WALTER: So I'm going to take that one credit per acre was not given to Ringhoff in spite of County
Legislature now Supervisor Romaine's letter.

MR. BARON: Right. We are using the Ringhoff matter and the letter by
Legislature Romaine to go on the theory that the Pine Barrens Commission and the Clearinghouse must follow precedent in prior decisions as stated by
Mr. Romaine. So it's not being used for the purpose of what Ringhoff got. It's being used for the purpose of prior decisions and I want to seg-way into Gazza case.

Now, with Gazza, that was heard by the board in 2001. It was 1.15 acres in the core, they requested a full credit for the acreage. The zoning being a five-acre zoning, CR-200, identical to my clients. In its first appeal, the board or the



HEARING

| Commission went from .18 to .19 Pine      |
|---|
| Barrens Credit. There was a second appear |
| based on fronting on Sunrise Highway to   |
| the Middle Line Road and he was denied    |
| because Sunrise Highway was a limited     |
| access road.                              |

And the third and final appeal, it was argued that the 40,000 square feet met the standards of Article 6 and the reasoning was that it was 40,000 square feet. It was a buildable lot under the Suffolk County Health Code, therefore, they were awarded one full Pine Barrens Credit per acreage for this parcel. As Mr. Eagan points out, if you look to the aerial, you will see it's probably unbuildable 20 feet wide and they still awarded one credit for each acre notwithstanding the fact that it was unbuildable.

And if we move onto the Sipala and Alberto decision, they basically appealed the six Letters of Interpretation when the Clearinghouse only allocated .75 Pine Barrens Credits for 3.52 acres. The Commission, this Commission, determined



| 1  | that based on Article 6 of the Suffolk     |
|----|--|
| 2  | County Health Code, the lots can           |
| 3  | reasonably be built using the formula      |
| 4  | 40,000 square feet and A-5 zoning, which   |
| 5  | is exactly what we have here. Although     |
| 6  | the Commission also determined that the    |
| 7  | lots were not single and separate as       |
| 8  | defined by the town code, the Pine Barrens |
| 9  | Commission still ruled and concluded that  |
| LO | the appellant's holdings could be          |
| L1 | developed as a 40,000 square foot parcel   |
| L2 | based on A-5 zoning, in other words, five  |
| L3 | acres. And they had no real frontage and   |
| L4 | they were on an old file map as well as    |
| L5 | us.  |
| L6 | So assembling the numerous                 |
|    |  |

noncontiguous parcels is identical to what we are doing here because in the Sipala Alberto matter, they took all the appellant's noncontiguous single and separate parcels that did not meet zoning and created 3.52 acres and gave them one credit for 40,000 square feet based upon Article 6.

It's respectfully argued that this



17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Commission most follow precedent, must be consistent on the formula being applied to the acreage as it goes to the Pine Barrens Credits.

2.4

Once again, in the Gazza matter, the Commission stated they were going to apply the Suffolk County Sanitary Code, Section 716-606 (B)(2) as the standard for determining the lot area based on the sanitary code as it effects groundwater management issues. The sanitary code permits one house for 40,000 square feet with a well. Pine Barrens Commission has adopted this equation in Gazza and respectfully they must do the same here.

Real briefly. Back in 2004, in the Breslin AVR matter, 2004, 80 acres, majority in the core, A-5 zoning on a dirt road, two-thirds in the core. Pine Barrens Credit awarded a formula of one credit of 40,000 square feet or a buildable acre on an approved dirt road. There was no hearing. It's just on the paperwork. It was a dirt road, it was not paved and it was similar to ours and was



2.1

sand lined. We are in the same
hydrological zone. We believe we are
entitled to one credit per one acre.

In Alberto, scattered lots on a filed map which were assembled but not touching for the purpose of creating acreage. Once again, Gazza was unbuildable. It was 20 feet wide, 2,000 feet long, non-buildable, and they received credits based upon square footage on the property. Not on the fact it was built not on the road.

The Pine Barrens Commission has previously granted one Pine Barrens Credit per acre, per lot that is noncontiguous, not on roads, mostly unbuildable and those applications were more severe and more difficult to make out a case than ours.

We have the Barlett 3-lot subdivision considered nondevelopment under the ECL Section 57 0107-13 without residential zoning, the Bartlett. Letters of Interpretation in 1999 to Gibbons was nondevelopment and nonsubject to the Pine Barrens Commission review or any other state official or regulation. It's clear

2.1

that this parcel should either be given one acre per one credit or be deemed nondevelopment, or if it's sterilized it should be given the rate of one credit per one acre.

If granted for construction purposes, we can build single-family residence homes on one house per acre on this site, which would be feasible, but once again, just going to the core issue, on all these precedents cited -- and I encourage you and respectfully request that you read them and use them as stare decisis or the precedent here is that the Commission did award in very similar situations one acre -- one Pine Barren Credit for one acre and we are entitled to that as well here.

MR. WALTER: I have to ask some questions.

MR. BARON: Please.

MR. WALTER: Because I don't know that we even framed the issue here. Is the issue -- first of all, how many credits are you looking for total?



| 1  | MR. BARON: 20, 20.88.                   |
|----|---|
| 2  | MR. WALTER: So the issue is because     |
| 3  | you abandoned the roads it is now one   |
| 4  | parcel that dates back prior to 1995    |
| 5  | these parcels did not exist in 1995     |
| 6  | because you abandoned the road. In      |
| 7  | other words, if you did not abandon the |
| 8  | road, you would have 10 lots that are   |
| 9  | about an acre and you would get 10      |
| 10 | credits. I am assuming this             |
| 11 | MR. MILAZZO: I'm not going to           |
| 12 | concede they get 10 credits. I'm not    |
| 13 | sure exactly                            |
| 14 | MR. WALTER: What's the issue?           |
| 15 | MR. BARON: We are looking for the       |
| 16 | 20 point whatever credits.              |
| 17 | MS. PRUSINOWSKI: Is this the map?       |
| 18 | THE WITNESS: That's the map in the      |
| 19 | commission. You are referring to which  |
| 20 | exhibit? B our B.                       |
| 21 | MR. MILAZZO: Commission B               |
| 22 | MR. ARMAND EAGAN: I would like to       |
| 23 | be sworn in.                            |
| 24 | MR. WALTER: This map right here         |



MR. BARON: Right.

MR. WALTER: Is this --1 2 MR. MILAZZO: Referring to Commission B. 3 The brown square yellow 4 MR. BARON: 5 area. MR. WALTER: What I am referring to, 6 7 this is all the parcels right here? really have no idea what you are asking. 8 If you can't figure it out, I don't know 9 10 how I'm going to vote on it. I don't know what you are asking for. 11 12 Explain it. MR. BARON: 13 MR. ARMAND EAGAN: I quess I'll be sworn in. 14 15 MR. MILAZZO: Swear him in. 16 MR. WALTER: He's got to be sworn 17 in. 18 MR. MILAZZO: And I do -- Mr. Eagan, 19 Armand, just remember we are taking a 20 record. You guys say whatever you like 2.1 on the record, but if you speak too 22 quickly we won't record it and if you speak over each other, we won't reflect 23

I want the record to be crystal



clear.

2.4

Swear him in, please.

2.1

MR. ARMAND EAGAN: Wonderful.

MR. MILAZZO:

A R M A N D E A G A N, the witness herein, having been first duly sworn before a Notary Public of the State of New York, was examined and testified as follows:

THE WITNESS: Armand, A-R-M-A-N-D, Eagan, E-A-G-A-N, 114 Willis Avenue, Owner of Armand Gustave, LLC. These 10 lots here were held in continuous ownership since prior to 1978 -- '73 when the last deed was. They have always owned the center of the road according to the deed, according to our deed, according to the previous deed from Mr. Trifoli. They own the center of the road to this day. All we did was abandon the roads.

MR. MILAZZO: When did you do that?

THE WITNESS: In 2017, but we've always owned the center of the road.

MR. MILAZZO: When did you acquire it?

THE WITNESS: 2017. We are here for Pine Barrens Credits, of course. We



always owned the center of the road.

MR. WALTER: Now you framed the issue for me. If you did not abandon the roads, is it your belief that you would get one credit per acre for each one of these lots?

THE WITNESS: We should always get one credit per one acre because that's what the Commission gave to all these other exhibits in the CR-200 zone.

MR. WALTER: The issue that I -what I see is if you didn't abandon
this, you wouldn't even be here because
you probably would have got something
closer to what you were looking for?

MS. PRUSINOWSKI: That contradicts testimony.

THE WITNESS: We still would be here. If we didn't abandon this, we still would be here based on the fact that each parcel is entitled to one credit per one acre as you have given. The three exhibits that we presented, the AVR, the Breslin, which is 200-504-17.2. The Gazza, 900-241-132, and the



Alberto Sipala -- the Alberto Sipala decision, which I don't know those maps, but you guys have them there.

MR. WALTER: What you did was you took 10 lots that you could have, in fact, potentially put 10 houses on if this was, in fact, a buildable property and created one lot.

THE WITNESS: Yeah, which is completely within our right. We own the property.

MR. WALTER: Once you created the one lot, you were not able to put 10 or 20 houses on whatever -- I don't know what the zoning is here.

THE WITNESS: It's A-5 zoning,

CR-200 zoning. Meets current zoning

under the Town of Southampton CR-200,

200,000 square feet. It's 20.88 acres,

five-acre zoning. We could go because

it's nondevelopment as of right -- based

on the Bartlett letter that says -- the

Bartlett letter says "Meets current

zoning, therefore, is nondevelopment."

That's Exhibit J or 10.



going to speculate.

THE WITNESS: Please don't 1 2 speculate. 3 MS. PRUSINOWSKI: What is the legal basis for saying this is one lot? 4 5 did that originate? What's the basis 6 for it? 7 THE WITNESS: We have always owned the center of the roads. If you look at 8 9 the deed --10 MS. PRUSINOWSKI: That's not helping 11 That's not answering the question. 12 THE WITNESS: If you look at this 13 deed here, it says "Together with all 14 right, title and interest, if any, of 15 the party of the first part of, in and 16 to any streets and roads abutting the 17 above-described premises to the center 18 lines thereof." That means that we have 19 owned the center of the road -- this was 20 the deed from 1973. The current deed 2.1 that I have says that, so we have always

23 to go to planning to abandon a road.

24 It's a clerical procedure. It's just a

-- it's not a planning -- you don't have

25 | matter of we can no longer put in



Hampton Road and part of Warren Street 1 2 and whatever part of whatever streets I 3 abandoned don't exist anymore. If you can go stand by 4 MR. WALTER: 5 your attorney, that would be very 6 helpful. 7 I just had to --THE WITNESS: MS. PRUSINOWSKI: You are not 8 9 answering my question. What is the 10 legal basis for calling this one parcel? 11 MR. WALTER: I agree with that 12 I would love to know. question. 13 THE WITNESS: Under Article 6 you 14 gave everybody else one credit per acre. 15 You gave the three exhibits we 16 presented, one credit per one acre. 17 are asking for the same for our 20.88 18 acres, which exists currently today. 19 All we are asking for nondevelopment 20 based on the fact that it meets current 21 zoning and we can go to the town because 22 it meets current zoning like you have allowed other applicants to you said. 23 The Pine Barrens is no jurisdiction. 24 Ιt

currently 20.88 acres, meets current



zoning or we want one credit per 40,000 1 2 square feet like you gave the other 3 applicants. It's currently 20.88 acres. That's how it's situated today. We want 4 5 what everybody else was given. 6 MR. MILAZZO: Is that your legal 7 argument "we want"? MR. BARON: We are entitled. 8 THE WITNESS: We are entitled. I am 9 10 not an attorney obviously. 11 MR. MILAZZO: I just want to 12 understand that the basis of your 13 argument is you are entitled to. 14 MR. BARON: Yes. Based on prior 15 cases. 16 MS. PRUSINOWSKI: No one has 17 answered my question yet. MR. WALTER: Right. I would love 18 19 the answer to that question. 20 MR. SCHNEIDERMAN: This is all Pine 21 Barrens. 22 MR. BARON: The madame's question. 23 This is the point they are trying to --



just answer their question.

THE WITNESS: What's the question?

24

| 1  | MR. BARON: Once more time, ma'am.        |
|----|--|
| 2  | Your question is?                        |
| 3  | MS. PRUSINOWSKI: What is the legal       |
| 4  | basis for calling this assemblage one    |
| 5  | parcel?                                  |
| 6  | THE WITNESS: That's been answered        |
| 7  | and we are done.                         |
| 8  | MR. BARON: Thank you.                    |
| 9  | MR. MILAZZO: We will reserve             |
| 10 | decision as agreed to in the beginning   |
| 11 | so we have an argument at the end.       |
| 12 | THE WITNESS: Excuse me? What did         |
| 13 | you just say?                            |
| 14 | MR. MILAZZO: I said we are going to      |
| 15 | reserve decision as we made with your    |
| 16 | attorney at the beginning of the         |
| 17 | hearing.                                 |
| 18 | THE WITNESS: We are going to close       |
| 19 | the hearing though.                      |
| 20 | MR. MILAZZO: Well, the Commission        |
| 21 | will decide what they are going to do.   |
| 22 | MR. WALTER: I would love to hear         |
| 23 | public comment.                          |
| 24 | MS. GALLAGHER: And the public can        |
| 25 | make comments during the Public Hearing. |



| 1  | MR. MILAZZO: Absolutely. I just                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | didn't want to have an argument when the             |
| 3  | decision was due.                                    |
| 4  | MR. WALTER: But they have rested                     |
| 5  | their case.  |
| 6  | MR. MILAZZO: Yes.                                    |
| 7  | MS. GALLAGHER: Mr. Amper, would you                  |
| 8  | like to recognize on comment on the                  |
| 9  | matter in this hearing?                              |
| LO | RICHARD AMPER, the witness herein,                   |
| L1 | having been first duly sworn before a Notary Public  |
| L2 | of the State of New York, was examined and testified |
| 13 | as follows:  |
| L4 | THE WITNESS: Richard Amper,                          |
| 15 | Executed Director of the Long Island                 |
| 16 | Pine Barrens Society, 547 East Main                  |
| 17 | Street, Riverhead. The Pine Barrens                  |
| 18 | Society is asking the Commission to                  |
| 19 | award the proper number of credits to                |
| 20 | this applicant as conformed to the Pine              |
| 21 | Barrens Act and Pine Barrens Credit                  |
| 22 | Clearinghouse.                                       |
| 23 | MS. GALLAGHER: Any other testimony                   |
| 24 | or comments?   |
| 25 | MR. WALTER: I make a motion we                       |



| 1  | close the public portion of the hearing  |
|----|--|
| 2  | and leave it open for written comment.   |
| 3  | MR. MILAZZO: I think the Commission      |
| 4  | can close the hearing, close the record  |
| 5  | and I make a request.                    |
| 6  | MR. WALTER: Close the hearing,           |
| 7  | close the record.                        |
| 8  | MR. MILAZZO: And I would suggest         |
| 9  | that you give a decision by your         |
| 10 | November meeting so that there is time   |
| 11 | to research. They gave us a significant  |
| 12 | amount of testimony, a significant       |
| 13 | number of documents and we have to check |
| 14 | to see what the arguments are so we know |
| 15 | that we are consistent with prior        |
| 16 | precedents.                              |
| 17 | MR. WALTER: I make a decision to         |
| 18 | close the hearing and close the comment  |
| 19 | period.                                  |
| 20 | MR. BARON: That's fine. Thank you.       |
| 21 | MR. MILAZZO: And we are on               |
| 22 | contingence to reserve the decision. So  |
| 23 | hopefully the November meeting.          |
|    |  |

Thank you very much.

All in favor?



MR. BARON:

MS. GALLAGHER:

24

```
(Whereupon, there was a unanimous
1
2
     affirmative vote of the Commission.)
3
         MS. GALLAGHER: Any oppose?
                                        Any
     extension?
4
         MR. ARMAND EAGAN: Have a good day
5
     everybody. Thanks for listening.
6
7
        (Whereupon, this hearing was
8
     adjourned at 4:17 p.m.)
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```



| 1  | CERTIFICATION                                       |
|----|---|
| 2  |   |
| 3  | STATE OF NEW YORK )                                 |
| 4  | ) SS  |
| 5  | COUNTY OF SUFFOLK )                                 |
| 6  |   |
| 7  | I, CHARISSA SCHWAB, a Shorthand                     |
| 8  | Reporter and Notary Public within and for the State |
| 9  | of New York, do hereby certify:                     |
| 10 | THAT the foregoing transcript is a true             |
| 11 | and accurate transcript of my original stenographic |
| 12 | notes.  |
| 13 | IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set             |
| 14 | my hand this 20th day of September, 2017.           |
| 15 |   |
| 16 | (Spring & Dekart)                                   |
| 17 | Can although & Data American                        |
| 18 | CHARISSA SCHWAB                                     |
| 19 |   |
| 20 |   |
| 21 |   |
| 22 |   |
| 23 |   |
| 24 |   |
| 25 |   |



|                     |           | 14.4.0           | C - 10        | 7.17 10          |
|---------------------|-----------|------------------|---------------|------------------|
|                     | •         | 14:4,8<br>22:4,5 | 6:18<br>13:18 | 7:17,18<br>8:4,9 |
| Exhibits            | 0         | 22:4,5           | 13:10         | 17:9             |
|                     |           | 1999             | 3-lot         |                  |
| 553832 HEAR         | 0107-13   | 20:22            | 20:18         | 18:1,24<br>29:13 |
| ING.                | 20:20     |                  | 3.52          | 29:13            |
| EXHIBIT1            |           | •                | 17:24         | 605              |
| 653832 HEAR         | 4         | 2                | 18:22         | 8:10             |
| ING.                | 1         |                  | 10.22         | 63               |
| EXHIBIT2            |           | 2                | 30            | 4:14             |
| EARIBII2            | 1         | 5:20,24          | 11:15         | 4.14             |
| 653832 HEAR         | 5:18,19   | 6:8,11,17        |               |                  |
| ING.                | 6:17      | 2,000            | 4             | 7                |
| EXHIBIT3            | 1,200     | 20:8             | 4             |                  |
| 553832 HEAR         | 13:10     |                  |               | 7                |
| ING.                |           | 20               | 4             | 7:19             |
| EXHIBIT4            | 1.15      | 17:16            | 6:25 7:1,     |                  |
|                     | 16:21     | 20:7             | 2,5           | 7.2              |
| 653832 HEAR         | 10        | 22:1,16          | 40,000        | 25:25            |
| ING.                | 9:6       | 26:14            | 17:8,10       | 716-606          |
| EXHIBIT5            | 14:17,19  | 20.88            | 18:4,11,      | 19:8             |
| 553832 HEAR         | 22:8,9,12 |                  |               |                  |
| ING.                | 24:9      | 26:19            | 21 30:1       | 73               |
| EXHIBIT6            | 26:5,6,   | 29:17,25         |               | 24:11            |
|                     | 13,25     | 30:3             | 4:17          | 75               |
| 553832 HEAR         |           |                  | 34:8          | 17:23            |
| ING.                | 114       | 200,000          |               |                  |
| EXHIBIT7            | 24:8      | 13:19            | 5             | 766              |
| 653832 <b>HEA</b> R | 14        | 26:19            |               | 8:10             |
| ING.                | 6:9       | 200-504-1        | _             |                  |
| EXHIBIT8            |           | 25:24            | 5             | 8                |
|                     | 15        |                  | 7:12 8:8      | <b>-</b>         |
| 653832 HEAR         | 4:4       | 2001             | 13:18         | •                |
| ING.                | 17        | 16:21            | 500           | 8                |
| EXHIBIT9            | 8:25      | 2004             | 13:9          | 8:14,16,         |
| 653832 HEAR         |           | 8:25             |               | 21,23            |
| ING.                | 18        | 19:16,17         | 532           | 80               |
| EXHIBIT10           | 17:1      |                  | 4:19          | 19:17            |
|                     | 19        | 2007             | 547           |                  |
|                     | 17:1      | 6:20             | 32:16         | _                |
| (                   | 1072      | 2017             |               | 9                |
|                     | 1973      | 4:4 14:7         | 57            |                  |
| (B) (2)             | 6:9 28:20 | 24:20,24         | 20:20         | 9                |
| 19:8                | 1978      |                  |               | 8:16,20          |
|                     | 14:7      | _                | 6             | 9:5              |
|                     | 24:11     | 3                |               | 000 241 120      |
|                     | 1005      |                  | 6             | 900-241-132      |
|                     | 1995      | 3                | 6             | 25:25            |



| 95          | acquire     | 1,7:15      | appellant's | 10:1,7     |
|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|------------|
| 9:10        | 24:22       | affirmative | 18:10,20    | 13:3,4     |
| 99          | acre        | 34:2        | appellants  | 33:14      |
| 9:10        | 12:14       | afternoon   | 4:19        | Armand     |
|             | 15:4,10,    | 4:18        | applicant   | 4:6 5:2    |
| _           | 17 16:5     | 4:18        | 32:20       | 6:1,14     |
| A           | 17:18       | agree       | 32:20       | 7:20,21    |
|             | 19:22       | 9:5 29:11   | applicant's | 10:12      |
| <b>A-</b> 5 | 20:3,14     | agreed      | 13:21       | 11:8 14:2  |
| 14:24       | 21:2,5,8,   | 31:10       | applicants  | 22:22      |
| 18:4,12     | 16,17       |             | 29:23       | 23:13,19   |
| 19:18       | 22:9        | Alberto     | 30:3        | 24:1,7,9   |
| 26:16       | 25:5,8,22   | 7:13        |             | 34:5       |
| A-R-M-A-N-D | 29:14,16    | 17:21       | application | Article    |
| 24:7        | acreage     | 18:19       | 13:21       | 17:9       |
|             | 16:23       | 20:4 26:1   | application | 18:1,24    |
| abandon     | 17:14       | allocate    | s           | 29:13      |
| 22:7        | 19:3 20:6   | 4:1         | 20:16       |            |
| 24:18       |             | allocated   | applied     | assemblage |
| 25:3,12,    | acres       | 17:23       | 15:8 19:2   | 31:4       |
| 19 28:23    | 13:8,18     | 17:23       | 15:0 19:2   | assembled  |
| abandoned   | 14:20       | allowable   | apply       | 20:5       |
| 22:3,6      | 16:21       | 15:4        | 19:6        |            |
| 29:3        | 17:24       | allowed     | approval    | assembling |
| abandonment | 18:13,22    | 29:23       | 12:3        | 18:16      |
| 14:9        | 19:17       |             |             | Assume     |
| 14.9        | 26:19       | amount      | approved    | 15:14      |
| ability     | 29:18,25    | 10:4        | 19:22       | assuming   |
| 11:24       | 30:3        | 33:12       | area        | 22:10      |
| above-      | Act         | Amper       | 19:9 23:5   |            |
| described   | 15:7        | 32:7,14     |             | attach     |
| 28:17       | 32:21       |             | arguably    | 6:2        |
|             | add         | answering   | 14:14       | attorney   |
| absolutely  | 4:21        | 28:11       | argued      | 29:5       |
| 10:13       |             | 29:9        | 17:8        | 30:10      |
| 32:1        | adjourned   | anymore     | 18:25       | 31:16      |
| abutting    | 34:8        | 29:3        | argument    |            |
| 28:16       | admissibili | appeal      | 11:13,24    | August     |
| accepting   | ty          | 11:15,17    | 12:22       | 4:4        |
| 10:18       | 10:20       | 16:25       | 13:24       | Avenue     |
| 10:10       |             | 17:2,7      | 30:7,13     | 24:8       |
| access      | adopted     |             | 31:11       | AVR        |
| 17:6        | 19:14       | appealed    | 32:2        | 7:24       |
| accord      | aerial      | 17:21       |             | 19:17      |
| 4:24        | 6:23 7:4,   | appellant   | arguments   | 25:24      |
|             | 8,12        | 4:6         | 7:16        | 23.24      |



| award                            | 14,22     | belief     | 30:15       | code         |
|----------------------------------|-----------|------------|-------------|--------------|
| 21:15                            | 31:1,8    | 25:4       | center      | 7:19 8:5     |
| 32:19                            | 33:20,24  | beneficial | 24:13,16,   | 17:12        |
| awarded                          | Barren    | 15:20      | 21 25:1     | 18:2,8       |
| 17:13,17                         | 21:16     | 15.20      | 28:8,17,    | 19:7,10,     |
| 19:20                            | 21:10     | board      | 19          | 11           |
| 19:20                            | Barrens   | 16:21,25   | 19          | comment      |
| awarding                         | 4:2 13:15 | Boulevard  | CGA         | 31:23        |
| 14:15                            | 14:15     | 13:10      | 27:14,20    | 32:8         |
| aware                            | 15:6,10,  |            | chance      |              |
| 9:15 13:7                        | 16 16:12  | Breslin    | 9:24,25     | 33:2,18      |
| 9:15 15:7                        | 17:2,13,  | 19:17      | 9:24,25     | comments     |
|                                  | 24 18:8   | 25:24      | change      | 31:25        |
| В                                | 19:3,13,  | briefly    | 6:16        | 32:24        |
|                                  | 20 20:12, | 19:16      | 14:10       |              |
| B-2                              | 13,24     | 19:10      | check       | commission   |
|                                  | 24:25     | Broad      |             | 7:8,14       |
| 8:10,11                          | 29:24     | 4:19       | 33:13       | 10:15        |
| back                             | 30:21     | brown      | cited       | 11:13,16,    |
| 6:19                             | 32:16,17, | 23:4       | 21:11       | 23 12:6,     |
| 11:11                            | 21        | 23:4       | a1 a m i b  | 20 13:6,     |
| 19:16                            |           | build      | clarity     | 15,25        |
| 22:4                             | Bartlett  | 21:7       | 5:14        | 14:3,8       |
|                                  | 20:21     | buildable  | clear       | 15:2,17      |
| Barlett                          | 26:22,23  |            | 20:25       | 16:3,12      |
| 20:18                            | based     | 17:11      | 23:25       | 17:1,25      |
| 27:13                            | 17:3      | 19:22      | 01          | 18:6,9       |
| Baron                            | 18:1,12,  | 26:7       | Clearinghou | 19:1,6,13    |
| 4:18,19                          | 23 19:9   | built      | se          | 20:12,24     |
| 5:8,16,                          | 20:9      | 18:3       | 4:1 5:9     | 21:14        |
| 19,23                            | 25:20     | 20:11      | 13:22       | 22:19,21     |
| 6:12,14,                         | 26:21     |            | 14:15       | 23:3 25:9    |
| 22 7:1,                          | 27:22     |            | 16:13       | 31:20        |
| 11,23                            |           | C          | 17:23       | 32:18        |
| 8:10,16,                         | 29:20     |            | 32:22       | 33:3 34:2    |
| 20,23                            | 30:14     | calling    | clerical    |              |
| 9:1,4,12,                        | basically | 29:10      | 28:24       | Commission'  |
| 17,19                            | 17:21     | 31:4       |             | S            |
| 10:6                             | bogia     |            | clients     | 5:11         |
| 11:1,3                           | basis     | carry      | 13:7        | complete     |
|                                  | 28:4,5    | 15:15      | 16:24       | 6 <b>:</b> 6 |
| 12:8 13:6                        | 29:10     | case       | close       |              |
| 15:13,19                         | 30:12     | 15:18      | 31:18       | completely   |
| 16:9                             | 31:4      | 16:19      | 33:1,4,6,   | 26:10        |
| 21:21                            | beginning | 20:17      | 7,18        | concede      |
|                                  | 10:9 12:2 | 32:5       | 7,10        | 22:12        |
| 22:1,15,                         | 10.7 12.2 |            |             |              |
| 22:1,15,<br>25 23:4,<br>12 30:8, | 31:10,16  |            | closer      | concluded    |



## HEARING September 20, 2017 LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEAldex: conformed..east

| 18:9        | 9:23 13:7 | crystal   | 16:14,18      | 19:18,22, |
|-------------|-----------|-----------|---------------|-----------|
| conformed   | county    | 23:24     | decisis       | 24        |
| 32:20       | 7:19      | current   | 21:13         | documents |
|             | 15:15     | 26:17,23  |               | 10:21,25  |
| confusion   | 16:6      | 27:17     | deed          | 12:9,10   |
| 9:2 12:5    | 17:12     | 28:20     | 5:12 6:8,     | 33:13     |
| connection  | 18:2 19:7 | 29:20,22, | 23 7:6        |           |
| 6:24        |           | 25.20,22, | 14:1          | drivable  |
| 14:23       | courtesy  | 23        | 24:12,14,     | 13:12     |
| 15:24       | 11:20     |           | 15 28:9,      | drive     |
|             | 13:2      | D         | 13,20         | 13:13     |
| consequence | CR-200    |           | deeds         |           |
| 12:25       | 13:17     | DALE      | 14:6          | due       |
| Conservatio | 16:24     | 8:3,11    |               | 13:19     |
| n           | 25:10     |           | deemed        | 32:3      |
| 7:6 9:14    | 26:17,18  | dated     | 5:23 21:2     | duly      |
|             |           | 4:3 6:9   | defined       | 24:4      |
| considered  | created   | 8:25      | 18:8          | 32:11     |
| 20:19       | 6:24 14:8 | dates     |               |           |
| consistent  | 18:22     | 22:4      | delaying      | duplicate |
| 19:2        | 26:8,12   |           | 12:17         | 5:5       |
| 33:15       | creating  | day       | denial        |           |
|             | 20:6      | 24:17     | 5:5 12:4      | E         |
| constructio |           | 34:5      |               |           |
| n           | credit    | days      | denied        |           |
| 21:6        | 12:14     | 11:15     | 17:4          | E-A-G-A-N |
| contingence | 15:3,10,  |           | designation   | 24:8      |
| 33:22       | 17 16:5,  | deadline  | 14:10,20      | Eagan     |
|             | 22 17:2,  | 11:16,20  | 4 - 4 4 4 - 4 | 4:22 5:2  |
| continuous  | 13,17     | decide    | determinati   | 7:21 9:22 |
| 24:10       | 18:23     | 11:17     | on            | 10:12     |
| contradicts | 19:20,21  | 12:7      | 7:25          | 11:8      |
| 25:16       | 20:3,13   | 31:21     | determined    | 17:14     |
| contr       | 21:2,4,16 |           | 17:25         | 22:22     |
| copy        | 25:5,8,22 | decision  | 18:6          | 23:13,18  |
| 6:15        | 29:14,16  | 7:14      | da4a          | 24:1,8    |
| core        | 30:1      | 10:7,11,  | determining   | 34:5      |
| 14:16       | 32:21     | 24 11:18, | 19:9          |           |
| 16:22       | credits   | 22 12:17, | developed     | Eagans    |
| 19:18,19    | 4:2 12:4  | 24 17:21  | 18:11         | 14:1      |
| 21:10       | 14:15     | 26:2      | 4:ff:~1+      | Easement  |
| 27:13,20    | 17:24     | 31:10,15  | difficult     | 7:7 9:15  |
|             |           | 32:3      | 20:17         |           |
| correct     | 19:4 20:9 | 33:9,17,  | Director      | easier    |
| 7:11,18,    | 21:25     | 22        | 32:15         | 5:21      |
| 20 9:12     | 22:10,12, | decisions |               | east      |
|             | 16 24:25  |           | dirt          |           |
| counsel     | 32:19     | 12:20     | 13:11         | 13:9      |



#### HEARING September 20, 2017 LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEAL Index: ECL..heard

| ETTER OF INT  | ERPRETATION | JREDIT ALLOCA | TION APPEAL | muex: ECLnea |
|---------------|-------------|---------------|-------------|--------------|
| 32:16         | 12,23       | 6:1 33:25     | 19:2,20     | Gibbons      |
| ECL           | 9:7,15      | feasible      | framed      | 20:22        |
| 20:19         | 22:20       | 21:9          | 21:23       | give         |
| 20.19         | 26:25       |               | 25:2        | 4:11 33:9    |
| Ed            | 27:2        | feet          |             |              |
| 14:22         | exhibits    | 13:9,10,      | frontage    | good         |
| 15:14         | 4:25 6:7    | 19 17:8,      | 18:13       | 4:18 5:17    |
| effect        | 9:23        | 10,16         | fronting    | 27:12        |
| 14:14         | 10:19       | 18:4,23       | 17:3        | 34:5         |
| ·             | 11:5        | 19:12,21      |             | granted      |
| effects       | 14:22       | 20:8          | fronts      | 15:3         |
| 19:10         | 25:10,23    | 26:19         | 13:8        | 20:13        |
| encourage     | 29:15       | 30:2          | full        | 21:6         |
| 21:11         |             | figure        | 16:22       |              |
|               | exist       | 23:9          | 17:13       | grids        |
| end           | 22:5 29:3   |               |             | 4:15         |
| 10:10         | exists      | file          |             | ground       |
| 12:2,22       | 29:18       | 18:14         | G           | 7:9          |
| 31:11         |             | filed         |             |              |
| ended         | Exit        | 20:4          | GALLAGHER   | groundwater  |
| 13:22         | 4:14        |               | 4:9 5:7     | 19:10        |
| anlicht       | explain     | Filingeri     | 8:18        | guess        |
| enlight 11:25 | 4:22        | 6:10          | 31:24       | 23:13        |
| 11:25         | 23:12       | final         | 32:7,23     | 27:22        |
| entitled      |             | 17:7          | 33:25       | Gustave      |
| 12:13         | extension   | fine          | 34:3        | 14:2 24:9    |
| 15:9 20:3     | 11:4,19     | 5:25          | Garzle      | 14:2 24:9    |
| 21:17         | 34:4        | 33:20         | 7:2         | guys         |
| 25:21         |             | 33:20         | 1:2         | 23:20        |
| 30:8,9,13     | F           | fits          | gave        | 26:3         |
| equation      |             | 13:16         | 14:5        |              |
| 19:14         | fogo        | five-acre     | 18:22       | ***          |
| 10.14         | face        | 15:5          | 25:9        | H            |
| examined      | 4:21        | 16:23         | 29:14,15    |              |
| 24:5          | fact        | 26:20         | 30:2        | half         |
| 32:12         | 17:18       |               | 33:11       | 14:20        |
| Excuse        | 20:11       | follow        | Gazza       | Hampton      |
| 31:12         | 25:20       | 16:13         | 6:9,24      | 29:1         |
|               | 26:6,7      | 19:1          | 7:3,7       |              |
| Executed      | 29:20       | foot          | 8:18,19,    | Health       |
| 32:15         | farmland    | 18:11         | 22,23       | 17:12        |
| exhibit       | 15:22       |               | 16:19,20    | 18:2         |
| 4:4 5:4,      |             | footage       | 19:5,14     | hear         |
| 10,12         | fast        | 20:10         | 20:7        | 9:25         |
| 6:11,18,      | 12:20       | formula       | 25:25       | 31:22        |
|               |             |               | 49.49       |              |
| 25 7:1,5,     | favor       | 18:3          |             | heard        |



## HEARING September 20, 2017 LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEAllodex: hearing..March

| 16:20       | identical          | 4:10        | letters   |              |
|-------------|--------------------|-------------|-----------|--------------|
| hearing     | 16:24              | Joe         | 9:7 17:22 | M            |
| 7:10 8:9    | 18:17              | 6:9 7:7     | 20:21     |              |
| 10:10       | identified         |             | limit     | madame's     |
| 12:23       | 12:11              | John        | 8:5       | 30:22        |
| 19:23       |                    | 10:17       |           |              |
| 31:17,19,   | identify           | June        | limited   | made         |
| 25 32:9     | 5:2                | 6:9         | 17:5      | 7:16         |
| 33:1,4,6,   | important          |             | lined     | 10:1,11      |
| 18 34:7     | 15:24              | jurisdictio | 20:1      | 13:24        |
|             |                    | n           |           | 14:18        |
| held        | included           | 29:24       | lines     | 31:15        |
| 24:10       | 6:5                |             | 28:18     | main         |
| helpful     | includes           | L           | listen    | 13:24        |
| 29:6        | 7:25               |             | 13:2      | 32:16        |
|             | 4-4                | 1           | limbani   |              |
| helping     | interest           | land        | listening | majority     |
| 28:10       | 28:14              | 14:17       | 34:6      | 19:18        |
| Highway     | interjectio        | 15:21       | LLC       | make         |
| 13:11       | n                  | law         | 24:9      | 5:15,21      |
| 17:3,5      | 8:4                | 27:23       | long      | 6:4 10:6,    |
|             | Tntownwotat        | lead        | 20:8      | 9 11:12      |
| holdings    | Interpretat<br>ion | 8:8         | 32:15     | 13:5         |
| 18:10       |                    | 8:8         | 32:15     | 20:17        |
| Hollow      | 4:3 17:22          | leave       | longer    | 31:25        |
| 4:20        | 20:22              | 33:2        | 28:25     | 32:25        |
| homes       | interrupt          | legal       | lot       | 33:5,17      |
| 21:7        | 16:1               | 28:3        | 14:16     |              |
| 21:/        | Island             | 29:10       | 17:11     | makes        |
| house       | 32:15              | 30:6 31:3   | 19:9      | 7:12         |
| 19:12       | 52.15              | 30.0 31.3   | 20:14     | making       |
| 21:8        | issue              | Legislator  | 26:8,13   | 11:22        |
| houses      | 15:17              | 6:19        | 28:4      | managa       |
| 26:6,14     | 21:10,23,          | legislature |           | management   |
|             | 24 22:2,           | 14:23       | lots      | 19:11        |
| hydrologica | 14 25:3,           | 15:16       | 18:2,7    | map          |
| 1           | 11                 | 16:7,11     | 20:4 22:8 | 7:4 14:10    |
| 13:17       | issues             |             | 24:10     | 18:14        |
| 20:2        | 19:11              | letter      | 25:6 26:5 | 20:5         |
|             |                    | 4:3 5:5     | love      | 22:17,18,    |
| <b>-</b>    | items              | 6:19        | 29:12     | 24           |
| I           | 11:12              | 9:10,11     | 30:18     | mang         |
|             |                    | 14:21       | 31:22     | maps<br>26:2 |
| idea        | J                  | 15:15       | J 1 . 4 4 | 40:4         |
| 4:11 5:17   | U                  | 16:8,10     |           | March        |
| 23:8        |                    | 26:22,23    |           | 8:25         |
|             | Jerry              | 27:10,11    |           |              |



# HEARING September 20, 2017 LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEALINdex: marked..Pine

| marked            | 6:13,21,    | 20:19,23    | 24:13,21     | party       |
|-------------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|
| 5:24              | 25 7:5,22   | 21:3        | 25:1         | 28:15       |
| materials         | 8:15,19,    | 26:21,24    | 28:7,19      | passable    |
| 10:5              | 21,24       | 27:7,17     | owner        | 13:12       |
| 10:5              | 9:3,9,10,   | 29:19       | 5:13         | 13:12       |
| matter            | 21 10:8,    | nonsubject  | 14:3,11      | passage     |
| 7:13              | 14,22       | 20:23       | 24:9         | 15:6        |
| 10:18             | 11:2,6,10   | 20:23       | 24:9         | paved       |
| 11:20             | 12:19       | Notary      | ownership    | 19:25       |
| 12:6              | 15:25       | 24:4        | 24:11        | 19.23       |
| 14:24             | 22:11,21    | 32:11       | owns         | pen         |
| 15:20             | 23:2,15,    | notwithstan | 14:12        | 6:16        |
| 16:10             | 18 24:2,    | ding        | 14:12        | people      |
| 18:19             | 19,22       | •           |              | 4:22        |
| 19:5,17           | 27:1,3,5,   | 17:18       | P            | 4.22        |
| 28:25             | 8,12,21     | November    |              | period      |
| 32:9              | 30:6,11     | 33:10,23    | ro m         | 33:19       |
| 26                | 31:9,14,    | number      | p.m.<br>34:8 | permits     |
| Mccormick         | 20 32:1,6   | 5:15 12:4   | 34:0         | 19:12       |
| 10:17             | 33:3,8,21   | 27:22       | packet       | 17.12       |
| means             |             |             | 5:10,11      | Peter       |
| 14:11             | minutes     | 32:19       | paperwork    | 4:19 6:10   |
| 28:18             | 9:16,20     | 33:13       | 19:24        | photo       |
|                   | missing     | numerous    | 19:24        | 7:8         |
| meet              | 8:8         | 18:16       | parcel       | 7.0         |
| 18:21             |             |             | 4:2 7:3      | photograph  |
| meeting           | motion      |             | 14:5         | 6:23        |
| 9:16              | 32:25       | 0           | 17:14        | photographs |
| 33:10,23          | move        |             | 18:11        | 8:2         |
|                   | 5:9 17:20   | official    | 21:1 22:4    |             |
| meets             |             | 6:15        | 25:21        | pile        |
| 26:17,23          |             | 20:25       | 27:23        | 6:3         |
| 27:16             | N           |             | 29:10        | Pine        |
| 29:20,22,         |             | open        | 31:5         | 4:1 13:15   |
| 25                | necessarily | 33:2        |              | 14:14       |
| Melville          | 10:15       | oppose      | parcels      | 15:6,10,    |
| 4:20              |             | 34:3        | 7:9          | 16 16:12    |
|                   | non-        | ama1        | 14:17,18,    | 17:1,13,    |
| met               | buildable   | oral        | 19 18:17,    | 23 18:8     |
| 17:8              | 20:8        | 9:25        | 21 22:5      | 19:3,13,    |
| middle            | noncontiguo | originally  | 23:7         | 19.3,13,    |
| 4:15              | us          | 14:18       | part         | 13,23       |
| 14:12             | 18:17,20    | originata   | 28:15        | 21:16       |
| 17:4              | 20:14       | originate   | 29:1,2       |             |
|                   |             | 28:5        |              | 24:25       |
| Milazzo           | nondevelopm | owned       | partial      | 29:24       |
|                   | ent         | 12 10       | 8:9          | 30:20       |
| 5:14,18,<br>20,25 | enc         | 13:18       |              | 32:16,17,   |



# HEARING September 20, 2017 LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEAIndex: place..Ringhoff

| 20,21          |                    | public    | read       | 10:24            |
|----------------|--------------------|-----------|------------|------------------|
| place          | 7:2 20:13          | 13:12     | 11:5       | request          |
| 4:25 5:3       | prior              | 24:4      | 21:12      | 21:12            |
| 13:1           | 5:13 7:15          | 31:23,24, | ready      | 33:5             |
|                | 13:16              | 25 32:11  | 12:3,23    |                  |
| plan           | 14:2               | 33:1      | •          | requested        |
| 11:14          | 16:14,17           | purpose   | real       | 16:22            |
| planning       | 22:4               | 16:16,17  | 18:13      | research         |
| 28:22,23       | 24:11              | 20:6      | 19:16      | 33:11            |
| Dlambatt       | 27:23              |           | realty     |                  |
| Plunkett       | 30:14              | purposes  | 8:6        | reserve          |
| 9:8 27:11      | 33:15              | 21:6      |            | 10:7             |
| point          |                    | put       | reasoning  | 11:17            |
| 10:18          | procedure          | 6:3 26:6, | 17:9       | 31:9,15<br>33:22 |
| 22:16          | 28:24              | 13 28:25  | received   | 33:22            |
| 30:23          | process            |           | 20:9       | residence        |
| points         | 8:1 12:6           | -         | receiving  | 21:7             |
| 17:15          | project            | Q         | 12:9       | residential      |
|                | 7:25               |           |            | 20:20            |
| portion        | 1:45               | question  | recognize  |                  |
| 8:6 33:1       | proper             | 4:8 9:14  | 32:8       | resolution       |
| position       | 32:19              | 10:19     | record     | 8:24             |
| 12:13          | properties         | 15:12     | 5:1,3,15   | respect          |
| 13:20          | 15:4               | 16:1,2    | 6:3,15,24  | 11:22            |
|                |                    | 27:16,19  | 7:4 11:7,  | 13:20            |
| potentially    | property           | 28:11     | 9,11       |                  |
| 26:6           | 14:12,16,          | 29:9,12   | 23:20,21,  | respectfull      |
| precedent      | 25 15:9,           | 30:17,19, | 22,24      | У                |
| 16:13          | 23 20:10           | 22,24,25  | 33:4,7     | 14:9             |
| 19:1           | 26:7,11            | 31:2      |            | 18:25            |
| 21:14          | 27:13              | questions | reference  | 19:15            |
| mmodeder       | provided           | 21:20     | 7:12       | 21:12            |
| precedents     | 9:23 10:5          |           | referring  | rested           |
| 21:11<br>33:16 |                    | quick     | 22:19      | 32:4             |
| 33:10          | providing          | 8:3       | 23:2,6     | result           |
| predates       | 14:21              | quickly   | reflect    | 13:23            |
| 14:3           | provision          | 12:16     |            | 13:23            |
| premises       | 11:14              | 23:22     | 23:23      | review           |
| 28:17          | DDIICTMOWCUT       | •         | regulation | 9:24             |
|                | PRUSINOWSKI        |           | 20:25      | 20:24            |
| presented      | 4:7,10,16<br>22:17 | R         | remark     | Richard          |
| 15:1           |                    |           | 9:22       | 32:14            |
| 25:23          | 25:16              | rate      |            |                  |
| 29:16          | 28:3,10            | 21:4      | remember   | Ringhoff         |
| previous       | 29:8               | maaah     | 23:19      | 14:24            |
| 24:15          | 30:16              | reach     | render     | 15:8,18,         |
| 21.10          | 31:3               | 4:23      |            |                  |



# HEARING September 20, 2017 LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APP**ErAsi**ex: Ringhoff's..theory

| 20 16:6,   | rush          | Sipala      | 26:19         | Sunrise       |
|------------|---------------|-------------|---------------|---------------|
| 10,16      | 10:11         | 7:13        | 30:2          | 4:14          |
| Ringhoff's |               | 17:20       | stand         | 13:10         |
| 15:2       | ~             | 18:18       | 29:4          | 17:3,5        |
|            | S             | 26:1        |               | Supervisor    |
| Riverhead  |               | site        | standard      | 16:7          |
| 32:17      | sand          | 21:8        | 19:8          | 10.7          |
| road       | 20:1          | 21:0        | standards     | support       |
| 4:20       | sanitary      | situated    | 17:9          | 12:10,12      |
| 13:16      | 7:18 8:5      | 30:4        | 17.5          | supporting    |
| 14:9,13    | 19:7,10,      | situation   | stare         | 13:4          |
| 17:4,6     | 11            | 4:23        | 21:13         | 13.1          |
| 19:19,22,  | T T           | 4.23        | state         | Swear         |
| 24 20:11   | scattered     | situations  | 20:25         | 23:15         |
| 22:6,8     | 20:4          | 21:15       | 24:5          | 24:2          |
|            | SCHNEIDERMA   | smaller     | 32:12         | sworn         |
| 24:13,17,  | N SCHNEIDERMA | 14:18       |               | 22:23         |
| 21 25:1    | N<br>30:20    |             | stated        | 23:14,16      |
| 28:19,23   | 30:40         | Society     | 4:2 15:1      | 24:4          |
| 29:1       | Section       | 32:16,18    | 16:14         | 24:4<br>32:11 |
| roads      | 19:7          | south       | 19:6          | 34:11         |
| 20:15      | 20:20         | 13:10       | sterilized    | <u> </u>      |
| 22:3       |               | 13:10       | 21:3          | T             |
| 24:18      | seg-way       | Southampton | 21:3          |               |
| 25:4       | 16:18         | 13:8        | stop          | table         |
| 28:8,16    | separate      | 26:18       | 27:8          | 6:4           |
|            | 18:7,21       | southwest   | Street        | 6:4           |
| roadway    | g.0110.W.0    | 4:14        | 13:9 29:1     | tailored      |
| 13:11      | severe        | 4:14        | 32:17         | 12:11         |
| Romaine    | 20:16         | speak       | 32:17         | 4 a lud       |
| 6:19       | side          | 23:21,23    | streets       | taking        |
| 14:22      | 14:11         | anogulato   | 28:16         | 23:19         |
| 15:1       | adami Ei aant | speculate   | 29:2          | ten           |
| 16:11,15   | significant   | 27:25       | ab.d.ii.a.i.a | 9:23          |
|            | 10:4          | 28:2        | subdivision   | 11:12         |
| Romaine's  | 33:11,12      | speculation | 8:7 20:18     | 13:3          |
| 15:14      | similar       | 27:24       | submit        |               |
| 16:7       | 19:25         | anito       | 15:7          | testified     |
| Rose-      | 21:15         | spite       | Suffolk       | 24:5          |
| breslin    | admir 1       | 16:6        |               | 32:12         |
| 7:24       | simply        | square      | 7:19          | testimony     |
|            | 14:4,11       | 13:19       | 17:11         | 11:25         |
| ruled      | single        | 17:8,10     | 18:1 19:7     | 25:17         |
| 18:9       | 18:7,20       | 18:4,11,    | suggest       | 32:23         |
| rulings    |               | 23 19:12,   | 33:8          | 33:12         |
| 13:16      | single-       | 21 20:10    |               |               |
| 12:10      | family        | 23:4        | Summit        | theory        |
|            | 21:7          |             | 13:9          | 16:11         |



## HEARING September 20, 2017 LETTER OF INTERPRETATION CREDIT ALLOCATION APPEAIndex: thereof..zoning

| hereof     | 13:13         |             | 22:7              |
|------------|---------------|-------------|-------------------|
| 28:18      | turns         | W           | written           |
| hought     | 12:20         |             | 33:2              |
| 4:21 8:1   | TVERDYY       | wait        |                   |
| hreshold   | 4:13          | 11:1        | wrote<br>27:10,11 |
| 10:2       | 4:13          | Waltel      | 27:10,11          |
| 10:2       | two-thirds    |             |                   |
| ime        | 19:19         | 8:17,20     | Y                 |
| 10:3,12    |               | 9:6 27:4    |                   |
| 11:4       |               | WALTER      | yellow            |
| 14:23      | Ŭ             | 9:13,18     | 23:4              |
| 15:6 31:1  |               | 15:11,14    | 23:4              |
| 33:10      | unable        | 16:4        | York              |
| imeline    | 4:1           | 21:19,22    | 4:20 24:5         |
| 11:21      | unanimous     | 22:2,14,    | 32:12             |
| 11:21      | 34:1          | 24 23:1,    |                   |
| itle       | 34:1          | 6,16        |                   |
| 28:14      | unbuildable   | 25:2,11     | Z                 |
| odar       | 17:16,19      | 26:4,12     |                   |
| oday       | 20:7,15       | 27:18       | zone              |
| 10:1,24    | understand    | 29:4,11     | 13:18             |
| 29:18      | 12:8          | 30:18       | 20:2              |
| 30:4       | 30:12         | 31:22       | 25:10             |
| old        | 30:12         | 32:4,25     | ronod             |
| 15:19      | understandi   | 33:6,17     | zoned             |
| otal       | ng            |             | 15:5              |
| 21:25      | 13:1          | wanted      | zoning            |
| 21:25      | utilities     | 12:1        | 13:17             |
| ouching    | 13:14         | Warren      | 14:25             |
| 20:5       | 13.14         | 13:9 29:1   | 16:23,24          |
| own        |               |             | 18:4,12,          |
| 18:8       | v             | weight      | 21 19:18          |
| 26:18      |               | 10:20       | 20:21             |
| 29:21      | vacant        | 15:15       | 26:15,16,         |
|            | 15:23         | Westhampton | 17,20,24          |
| ranscript  |               | 4:11        | 27:17             |
| 6:5,6      | version       |             | 29:21,22          |
| 7:10       | 27:23         | wide        | 30:1              |
| ranscripts | vicinity      | 17:17       |                   |
| 7:15       | 15:5          | 20:8        |                   |
| /:13       |               | Willis      |                   |
| 'rifoli    | voluminous    | 24:8        |                   |
| 24:16      | 12:9          |             |                   |
| rue        | vote          | Wonderful   |                   |
|            | , 000         | 24:1        |                   |
|            | 23.10         |             |                   |
| 14:4       | 23:10<br>34:2 | words       |                   |

